



UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE
United States Patent and Trademark Office
Address: COMMISSIONER FOR PATENTS
P.O. Box 1450
Alexandria, Virginia 22313-1450
www.uspto.gov

APPLICATION NO.	FILING DATE	FIRST NAMED INVENTOR	ATTORNEY DOCKET NO.	CONFIRMATION NO.
10/582,749	06/14/2006	Martin Brunner	PIP1-23002/A/PCT	5026
324	7590	06/24/2009		
JoAnn Villamizar				
Ciba Corporation/Patent Department				
540 White Plains Road				
P.O. Box 2005				
Tarrytown, NY 10591				
EXAMINER				
BUTTNER, DAVID J				
ART UNIT		PAPER NUMBER		
1796				
NOTIFICATION DATE		DELIVERY MODE		
06/24/2009		ELECTRONIC		

Please find below and/or attached an Office communication concerning this application or proceeding.

The time period for reply, if any, is set in the attached communication.

Notice of the Office communication was sent electronically on above-indicated "Notification Date" to the following e-mail address(es):

andrea.dececchis@ciba.com
deborah.pinori@ciba.com
sonny.nkansa@basf.com

Office Action Summary

Application No.

10/582,749

Applicant(s)

BRUNNER ET AL.

Examiner

David Buttner

Art Unit

1796

Period for Reply -- The MAILING DATE of this communication appears on the cover sheet with the correspondence address --

A SHORTENED STATUTORY PERIOD FOR REPLY IS SET TO EXPIRE 3 MONTH(S) OR THIRTY (30) DAYS, WHICHEVER IS LONGER, FROM THE MAILING DATE OF THIS COMMUNICATION.

- Extensions of time may be available under the provisions of 37 CFR 1.136(a). In no event, however, may a reply be timely filed after SIX (6) MONTHS from the mailing date of this communication.
- If NO period for reply is specified above, the maximum statutory period will apply and will expire SIX (6) MONTHS from the mailing date of this communication.
- Failure to reply within the set or extended period for reply will, by statute, cause the application to become ABANDONED (35 U.S.C. § 133). Any reply received by the Office later than three months after the mailing date of this communication, even if timely filed, may reduce any earned patent term adjustment. See 37 CFR 1.704(b).

Status

- 1) ☒ Responsive to communication(s) filed on 06 May 2009.
- 2a) ☒ This action is **FINAL**. 2b) ☐ This action is non-final.
- 3) ☐ Since this application is in condition for allowance except for formal matters, prosecution as to the merits is closed in accordance with the practice under *Ex parte Quayle*, 1935 C.D. 11, 453 O.G. 213.

Disposition of Claims

- 4) ☒ Claim(s) 1, 2 and 5-16 is/are pending in the application.
- 4a) Of the above claim(s) _____ is/are withdrawn from consideration.
- 5) ☐ Claim(s) _____ is/are allowed.
- 6) ☒ Claim(s) 1, 2, 5-16 is/are rejected.
- 7) ☐ Claim(s) _____ is/are objected to.
- 8) ☐ Claim(s) _____ are subject to restriction and/or election requirement.

Application Papers

- 9) ☐ The specification is objected to by the Examiner.
- 10) ☐ The drawing(s) filed on _____ is/are: a) ☐ accepted or b) ☐ objected to by the Examiner.
- Applicant may not request that any objection to the drawing(s) be held in abeyance. See 37 CFR 1.85(a).
- Replacement drawing sheet(s) including the correction is required if the drawing(s) is objected to. See 37 CFR 1.121(d).
- 11) ☐ The oath or declaration is objected to by the Examiner. Note the attached Office Action or form PTO-152.

Priority under 35 U.S.C. § 119

- 12) ☐ Acknowledgment is made of a claim for foreign priority under 35 U.S.C. § 119(a)-(d) or (f).
- a) ☐ All b) ☐ Some * c) ☐ None of:
1. ☐ Certified copies of the priority documents have been received.
 2. ☐ Certified copies of the priority documents have been received in Application No. _____.
 3. ☐ Copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been received in this National Stage application from the International Bureau (PCT Rule 17.2(a)).

* See the attached detailed Office action for a list of the certified copies not received.

Attachment(s)

- 1) ☐ Notice of References Cited (PTO-892)
- 2) ☐ Notice of Draftsperson's Patent Drawing Review (PTO-948)
- 3) ☐ Information Disclosure Statement(s) (PTO/CDC)
- 4) ☐ Interview Summary (PTO-413)
- 5) ☐ Notice of Informal Patent Application
- 6) ☐ Other: _____
- Paper No(s)/Mail Date _____

Claims 1,2,5-12 and 14-16 rejected under 35 U.S.C. 102(b) as anticipated by or, in the alternative, under 35 U.S.C. 103(a) as obvious over Nagao EP837085.

Nagao claims (#11) a polycarbonate based on bisphenol compounds and $-O-Rf^2$ terminal groups. Rf^2 (claim 12) can be $F-(CF_2)_r-(CH_2)_s-$ which corresponds to applicant's preferred endgroups R^1 and R^2 when "r" is 4-15 and "s" is 2. The compound 1H, 1H, 2H, 2H perfluorohexanol (page 13 line 53) is one of several specific endcapping agents named that meet applicant's preferred R^1 and R^2 . This polymer can be combined with antioxidants such as phenolic antioxidants (page 81 line 18; page 82 line 10). The polymer can be combined with another polycarbonate (page 18 line 16). Inherently, such a blending step would lower the surface energy of the other polycarbonate.

The reduced viscosity of the polycarbonate (abstract) can be as low as 0.2 dl/g which indicates a low molecular weight and relatively few repeating units.

Ishiwa '878 is cited for his correlation between Mw and viscosity (col 8 line 34).

Claims 1,2 and 5-16 rejected under 35 U.S.C. 103(a) as obvious over Nagao EP837085.

Nagao does not teach the relative amounts of fluorinated polycarbonate and other polycarbonate.

It would have been within the ordinary skill of the art to vary the proportions of each polycarbonate to obtain a final product with the "in-between" properties of each.

Applicant's arguments filed 5/6/09 have been fully considered but they are not persuasive.

Applicant argues that the claims no longer permit R_3 and R_4 to form a ring.

Nagao does not require such a ring. Nagao's claim 11 permits "W" to be –
CR⁵²R⁵³ which is isopropylidene (ie bisphenol A) when both R's are methyl.

Lee '040 lacks the –CF₃ endgroup now required. Brunelle '438 lacks lacks
applicant's "p is 4-15". Applicant's claims do not permit the presence of JP06220182's
"A" between the R_i and the polycarbonate repeating units.

THIS ACTION IS MADE FINAL. Applicant is reminded of the extension of time
policy as set forth in 37 CFR 1.136(a).

A shortened statutory period for reply to this final action is set to expire THREE
MONTHS from the mailing date of this action. In the event a first reply is filed within
TWO MONTHS of the mailing date of this final action and the advisory action is not
mailed until after the end of the THREE-MONTH shortened statutory period, then the
shortened statutory period will expire on the date the advisory action is mailed, and any
extension fee pursuant to 37 CFR 1.136(a) will be calculated from the mailing date of
the advisory action. In no event, however, will the statutory period for reply expire later
than SIX MONTHS from the mailing date of this final action.

Any inquiry concerning this communication or earlier communications from the
examiner should be directed to David Buttner whose telephone number is 571-272-
1084. The examiner can normally be reached on weekdays from 10 to 5pm.

If attempts to reach the examiner by telephone are unsuccessful, the examiner's
supervisor, Jim Seidleck, can be reached on 571-272-1078. The fax phone number for
the organization where this application or proceeding is assigned is 571-273-8300.

Information regarding the status of an application may be obtained from the Patent Application Information Retrieval (PAIR) system. Status information for published applications may be obtained from either Private PAIR or Public PAIR. Status information for unpublished applications is available through Private PAIR only. For more information about the PAIR system, see <http://pair-direct.uspto.gov>. Should you have questions on access to the Private PAIR system, contact the Electronic Business Center (EBC) at 866-217-9197 (toll-free).

David Buttner

6/19/09

/David Buttner/

Primary Examiner, Art Unit 1796